

FEATURES
OF
THE TWO SCHOOLS
(Vol. I)

By

The Learned `Allamah Sayyid Murtada Al-`Askari

Translated From the Original Arabic by:

M.J. Khalili

Edited by:

Shabib Rizvi



Naba Cultural Organization

شابک : 978-600-264-104-5 ؛ 978-600-264-103-8

شماره کتابشناسی ملی : ۵۵۳۴۳۰۹

عنوان و نام پدیدآور : / features of the two school vol.1: Maalim almadresatain

; translated From the Original Arabic by by the Learned Sayyid Murtada Al-Askari

; edited by Shabib Rizvi.M.J. Khalili.

مشخصات نشر : = 1397., 2018: Naba Cultural Organization Tehran

مشخصات ظاهری : ۷۶۰ص.

یادداشت : انگلیسی.

عنوان قراردادی : معالم المدرستین، انگلیسی، برگزیده

آوانویسی عنوان : فیچرز...

موضوع : امامت -- احادیث

موضوع : Imamate -- Hadiths

موضوع : خلافت -- احادیث

موضوع : Caliphate-- Hadiths

موضوع : اشهاد و اقتباس -- احادیث

موضوع : *Ijtihad and taqlid -- Hadiths

موضوع : اهل سنت و جماعت -- دوریه ها

موضوع : Sunnites -- Apologetic works

موضوع : شیعه -- دوریه ها

موضوع : Shi'ah -- Apologetic works

رده بندی دیویی : ۲۸/۲۹۷

رده بندی کنگره : BP/۱۴۱، ۱۲۰، ۴۹۱۲، ۸۶الف/

سرشناسه : عسکری، سیدمرتضی، ۱۱۰۳ - ۱۳۸۰.

Askari, Morteza

شناسه افزوده : خلیلی، محمدجعفر، مترجم

شناسه افزوده : Khaili, M.J.

وضعیت فهرست نویسی : فیا

Name of Book: **FEATURES OF THE TWO SCHOOLS Vol. 1**

Name of Author: *Allamah Sayyid Murtada Al-Askari*

Translator: *M.J.Khalili*

Editor: *Shabib Rizvi*

Date of Publication: 2019

First Edition

No. of Copies: 500

Publisher: Naba Organization

Address: P.O. Box: 13185-567 Tehran, Iran

e-mail: nabamobin@yahoo.com

ISBN: 978-600-264-103-8

Table of Contents

The Translator's Preface.....	21
A Brief Outlook of the Book.....	35
<i>Preliminary Discussions</i>.....	39
1.....	40
FOREWORD	40
External Destructive Factors	44
2.....	51
Consequences of the Differences within the Islamic Ummah: Personal Observations	51
3.....	59
Some Attributes of Allah and the Origin of Dispute about them.....	59
Concerning Visibility.....	62
The Difference in interpreting the emanations	66
The Origin of the Difference on Allah's Attributes and Visibility	69
4.....	73
The Difference about the Prophets' (peace be on them) Attributes	73
a. Getting Blessed by the Prophets' (peace be on them) Relics.....	73
b. Seeking the Intercession of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny).....	81
Referring to the Uncle (Abbas) of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny)	85
The Origin of the Difference about the Attributes of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)	86
5.....	96
The Differences on Celebrating the Birthdays of the Divine Prophets (peace be on them) and Allah's Righteous Servants (may Allah be satisfied with them)	96

8.....	Allamah 'Askari
--------	-----------------

The spreading of blessings from Adam (peace be on him) and celebrating his memory:.....	100
The spread of evil omen to a place due its occupier.....	101
The Origin of Evil Omen and Blessings of a Place:.....	102

6.....	105
--------	-----

The Disagreement on building on the graves of Divine Prophets (peace be on them all) and using them as places for worship.....	105
---	------------

The Proofs Supporting the Lawfulness of Taking the Prophets' Graveyards as Places for Worship	109
---	-----

7.....	113
--------	-----

The Difference on Weeping over the Dead and its Origin.....	113
--	------------

The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) wept over his son Ibraheem.....	114
--	-----

The Crying of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) over his grandson.....	115
--	-----

The Messenger of Allah(peace be on him and his progeny) Demands Weeping on his Uncle, Hamzah.....	116
---	-----

The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) wept over his mother's grave and caused the people around him to weep too.....	116
---	-----

The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) ordered food to be sent to the afflicted family.....	117
---	-----

The Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) assigned the mourning period	117
---	-----

The Origin of the Difference about Weeping over the Dead	118
--	-----

Umar narrates that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) had forbidden weeping but 'A'ishah, redressed him.....	119
--	-----

8.....	123
--------	-----

The Difference on the Interpretation of Some Verses from the Book of Allah.....	123
--	------------

The Judgment of other than Allah and Invoking other than Him.....	123
---	-----

Their Opponents' Reply.....	127
-----------------------------	-----

<i>Features of the two school (vol. 1)</i>	9
Allah's Ownership	129
The Creator and the Giver of Life	130
The Guardian and the Intercessor	131
WHO MAKES PEOPLE DIE?	134
A. The First Real Cause for Dispute	137
At the beginning of creation	137
In the past nations.....	137
In the days of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) ...	138
In the contemporary era	139
B. The Second Real Motive for Dispute	140
9.....	142
Summary and Conclusion	142
The Research Methodology of this book	145
The Definition of "Companion" in the school of the Companions.....	161
The Definition of "Companion" in the school of the Ahl al-Bait School	162
Their Criterion for Recognition of a Companion (<i>sahaabi</i>)	163
Discussion vis-à-vis Criteria of Recognition of the Companion	164
Chapter Two: Justice of the Companions as seen in the Two Schools	169
Chapter Three: Summing up the discussion of the Two Schools on the	
Companions.....	180
Chapter One:	187
Historical Reality of the Caliphate in the Early Days of Islam.....	187
The vesting of the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) Will	190
The Attitude of the Caliph 'Umar at the time of the Holy Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) Demise.....	191
Al-Saqīfah and Abu Bakr's Allegiance	193
The Warners	202
The General Allegiance.....	203
After the General Allegiance	205
The Messenger's Burial	205
Taking Refuge in Hazrat Fatima's (peace be on her) House	210

The Abstainers From Giving their Allegiance to Abu Bakr	222
‘Umar’s Caliphate and His Allegiance	229
The Consultation and ‘Uthman’s Allegiance	230
Allegiance to Imam ‘Ali (peace be on him).....	241
Chapter Two	245
The Discussions of the School of Caliphate about Imamate.....	245
The Opinion of the School of Caliphate and its proofs	246
First: The Caliph Abu Bakr said	246
Second: The Caliph ‘Umar Ibn al-Khattaab said	246
The Opinions of the Followers of the School of Caliphate	247
Obeying the Imam even if he contradicted the Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny).....	254
The Argument of the Later Followers of the Caliphate School	256
The Terms Used in Discussing Imamate and Caliphate.....	257
1. Al-Shuraa (The Consultative Committee).....	257
2) Al-Baiah (The Allegiance):	258
a. The Allegiance in the language of the Arabs:	258
b. Allegiance in Islam	259
1. The First Allegiance	260
2. The Second Greater Allegiance at al-‘Aqabah:.....	261
3. Bay’atur-Ridwaa or Bay’atush-Shajarah.....	262
Conclusion	267
Second. The Caliph and Allah’s Caliphate on the Earth	268
1. The Caliph and the Caliphate	268
a. In the days of the first Caliph	269
b. In the days of the second Caliph	269
2. Allah’s Caliph in the Earth.....	271
A. In Islamic terminology.....	271
Allah made His Caliphs as Leaders (Imams) for the people:.....	272
Allah Makes His Caliphs Do What Other Human Beings Cannot Do	275

Features of the two school (vol. 1).....	11
---	-----------

B. The Caliph and Allah's Caliph in the Terminology of the Muslims.....	279
a. In the Umayyad and Abbaside Eras.....	279
b. In the Ottoman Empire:	280
c. In Our Times:	280

From the School of Caliphate to the School of the Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them)	281
---	------------

Conclusion:.....	282
IV. Amir al-Mu'minin	284
V. Imam	285
VI. Al-Amr and 'Ulul Amr:.....	286
a. In the literature of the Arabs:.....	287
b. In the traditions of the Muslims.....	289
c. In the Islamic Texts	290
VII . The Successor (<i>wasi</i>) and the Will (<i>wasiyyah</i>).....	291

The Opinion of the Caliphate School	294
--	------------

The Opinion of the Caliphate School and the Argument	294
Firstly: The Caliph Abu Bakr	294
Secondly: 'Umar Ibn al-Khattaab.....	294
An Investigation in the Two Arguments.....	294
Thirdly: The Opinions of the followers of the Caliphate School.....	296

A. Discussing the Consultative Committee (Shooraa)	297
---	------------

 Proving the Consultative Committee (Shooraaa) by Allah's Book and His Messenger's (peace be on him and his progeny) Sunnah:.....	297
---	------------

First: Their arguing that the verse says: "And their affair is through mutual consultation."	298
Second: Their arguing that the verse says: "... And consult them in (your) affairs."	298
Third: Their arguing that the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) consulted his Companions.	299
a. The Battle of Badr.....	300
b. The Battle of Uhud	304
c. The Battle of Khandaq	308

B. Investigating the Allegiance as an Evidence..... 312

Third: Discussing the Evidence taken from Nahj al-Balaaghah in Favour of the Consultation, the Allegiance and the Acts of the Companions..... 321

D. Discussing the Evidence of the Establishment of the Caliphate by Force and Conquer 330

Obedying the Tyrannical Imam Contradicts the Sunnah of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) 331

Conclusion 334

Chapter Three: The Discussions of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) School on Imamate..... 337

Infallibility of Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) 339

The Cause of the Revelation of this Verse and what the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) did on this Occasion..... 339

The Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) Concern about Appointing the 'Ulul Amr after him 348

The Successors of the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny) in al-Madinah 355

Texts by the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) proving the Appointment of his successors after him 366

The Will (wasayyah) in Ancient Times..... 366

a. Adam's Will to (his son) Sheeth..... 367

b. The Episode of Yusha Ibn Noon, the successor of Prophet Moosa (peace be on him) 368

Similarities between the successors of the Seal of the Prophets (peace be on him and his progeny) and of Moosa (peace be on him) 369

c. The Episode of Sham'oon (Simon), the Successor of Prophet Eesa (peace be on him) 370

The Messenger's Successor, Minister, Heir and Caliph..... 373

The Successor in the Messenger's Narrations..... 373

<i>Features of the two school (vol. 1).....</i>	<i>13</i>
The Will in the Books of the Previous Nations	376
The Will in the Narrations of the Companions (<i>sahaabah</i>) and those who saw the Companions (<i>taabe'een</i>)	378
'Abdullah Ibn 'Ali, the Uncle of the Abbaside Caliph, al-Saffaah, Argues the Will as a Proof.....	389
Muhammad Ibn 'Abdillah Ibn Hasan Argued against the	390
(Abbaside) Caliph al-Mansur with the Will	390
The Caliph Harun al-Rashid Tells About What has reached to him from the Successors	392
<i>Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) Known as the Prophet's (peace be on him and his progeny) Successor</i>	<i>396</i>
In the Early Days of Islam	396
The Will in the Poems Recited about the Battle of the Camel (al-Jamal) (2)2	400
The Will in the Poems at Siffin	404
The Will in Ibn Abbas's Letter.....	409
The Will in al-Ma'mun's poetry.....	412
<i>Imam 'Ali (peace be on him), known as the successor (wasi) along Centuries.....</i>	<i>413</i>
<i>The School of Caliphate Exerts Great Efforts to Concede or Change What was known about the Succession (wasiyyah).....</i>	<i>420</i>
'A'ishah's Narration confirms that 'Ali (peace be on him) was the Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) Successor	420
A Comparision between the Narrations of 'A'ishah and that of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him)	431
Two Different Attitudes towards Imam 'Ali (peace be on him)	435
<i>Concealing the Virtues of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) and Propagating to Abuse and Curse him and the reason for both these actions.....</i>	<i>441</i>

Quraysh disliked that Both Prophethood and Caliphate be in the Banu Hashim	441
--	-----

Ban on Writing the Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) Traditions.....	456
---	-----

<i>The Politics of the Qurayshite Caliphate and all 'Umayyads:</i>	<i>458</i>
--	------------

a. During The Reign of Mu'awiyah	458
--	-----

Rearing the Syrians to Hate and Curse Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) since the Days of Mu'awiyah	473
---	-----

Why Did Mu'awiyah Hate the Banu Hashim?	476
---	-----

Ibn al-Zubair's Politics	477
--------------------------------	-----

b. The Reign of 'Abdul Malik and his Son	480
--	-----

<i>Some of Al-Hajjaaj's misdeeds in implementing the Quarashite Politics.....</i>	<i>483</i>
---	------------

<i>Al-Hajjaaj's misdemeanours was emulated by his brother, the ruler of Yemen, Muhammad Ibn. Yusuf al-Hanqafi, during his rule over Yemen.....</i>	<i>486</i>
--	------------

c. The Reign of 'Umar Ibn 'Abd al-'Aziz.....	486
--	-----

d. During the Reign of Hisham Ibn Abd al-Malik	490
--	-----

Khalid Ibn 'Abd Allah al-Qasri.....	492
-------------------------------------	-----

The Umayyads killed anyone named 'Ali.....	493
--	-----

<i>During the Reign of the Abbasides.....</i>	<i>495</i>
---	------------

First: The Scholars (Ulama)	495
-----------------------------------	-----

Second: The Ruling Class	496
--------------------------------	-----

Third: The Masses	497
-------------------------	-----

a.The Reign of al-Mansur	498
--------------------------------	-----

b. During the Reign of Mutawakkil.....	498
--	-----

Conclusion.....	502
-----------------	-----

<i>The Hostility of the Umayyads to Imam 'Ali (peace be on him)</i>	
---	--

<i>Features of the two school (vol. 1).....</i>	<i>15</i>
<i>and its Consequences</i>	<i>508</i>
The Policy of the Marwani Caliphates of Umayyad.....	509
The Policy of the Abbaside Caliphs	510
<i>Ten Kinds of Concealment and Distortion of the Tradition of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny).....</i>	<i>513</i>
<i>and of the News about the Conduct of his Ahl al-Bait (peace be on them) and Companions</i>	<i>513</i>
<i>A Study of what the School of Caliphate did to the Texts of the Tradition of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) which were Contrary to their Goals.....</i>	<i>514</i>
<i>The Denial of the Successorship.....</i>	<i>515</i>
a. Omission of a part of a hadith from the Tradition of the word Messenger of Allah(peace be on him and his progeny)and replacing it with an ambiguous or phrase.....	517
b. The Complete Omission of a hadith concerning the Companion's Conducts, yet without denying the Omission.....	521
c. Interpreting the meaning of a hadith of the Tradition of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny).....	522
A look at their on the One Traditions cursed by the Messenger (peace be on him and his progeny).....	525
Another Confusion in Interpreting the Meaning of Successor	530
d. Omitting parts of the Companions' sayings without mentioning the omission:	532
e. The Omission of a Complete Hadith from the Messenger's Sunnah without Admitting the Omission.....	536
f. The Prohibition of Writing Down the Sunnah of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny).	539
g. Declaring as Weak the Narratives and the Narrators of the Sunnah and Writings of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)	

which reduced the authority of the rulers, occasionally even killing those who opposed (this attempt) 542

1. Disparaging whoever mentioned the succession:.....543

2. Contesting the Narrators of Hadiths:548

3. Contesting the celebrated Narrators of Hadiths548

4. Al-Nesaa'i, one of the authors of a Sahih, and the Story of his Lynching...553

h. The Burning of Libraries and Books 555

i. The Omission or Distortion of Parts of Statements concerning the Companions' conducts: 560

j. Replacement of Original Narratives by Fabricated Ones 561

The Type of His Information and Narratives562

The Reason Behind the Spread of Saif's narrations from al-Fabari's Tarikh into the Books of History..... 565

A Contemplating Look into the Reason for the Most Celebrated Scholars to Choose Saif's Hadiths about Early Islam..... 567

a.The Story of al-'Ansi in Saif's Narratives 571

b.Khusru's Secret Conversation with the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) 574

His Allegation that Islam spread by the Sword and Shedding Blood 577

Saif's Exaggerations and lies about ar-Riddah wars 577

The Apostasy of the people of 'Ak and of the Ash'arayn, and the Story of Tahir, the foster-son of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) in Saif's Narratives..... 578

Tahir in Saif's Hadiths579

The Conquest of Olais and Destroying the Town of Amgheesheya 581

The Imam 'Ali's fame as the Successor was a Dilemma for the Caliphate School through Centuries..... 588

Saif tries to resolve the Problem of the Caliphate School..... 590

A Study of Saif's Narratives Concerning the Mischiefs 596

The Inventions and Distortions in Saif's Former Narratives.....	597
Abu Dharr (may Allah be pleased with him) in Mena During the Hajj	603
Abu Dharr (may Allah be pleased with him) in Baitullah al-Haraam.....	605
Abu Dharr (may Allah be pleased with him) in the Messenger of Allah's (peace be on him and his progeny) Mosque and elsewhere	606
A Summary of the Disturbances in 'Uthman's Later Days	608
<i>The Conclusion of the Comparative Discussion of Saif's Fabricated Narratives and the True Ones.....</i>	610
The Origin of Differences of Narratives in Islamic Sources	616
<i>The Conclusion of the Discussions and the Truth</i>	618
Once Again the Succession (wasiyyah).....	623
The Number of Dropped News, Narratives and Texts.....	625
<i>Surviving Texts from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) Concerning his Progeny's Right to Rule.....</i>	627
<i>Nominating the Successor in Different Terms.....</i>	628
The Minister of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)	629
The Caliph of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny).....	631
The Master of the Muslims after the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)	632
First: The Halalith of the Complaint.....	632
A Second Complaint.....	634
<i>Celebrating the Appointment of Imam 'Ali (peace be on him) as a Master-Designate after the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) and his Successor upon Islam and Muslims.....</i>	637
<i>The Event of Ghadir Khumm</i>	642
<i>How Similar was the Appointment of the Successor in this nation to the Appointment of the Successor in the Nation of Prophet Moosa'!</i>	651

Mastership and the Masters of Affairs in the Glorious Qur’an	652
a. ‘Ali’s Mastership in the Glorious Qur’an	652
b. The Possessors of Authority (Ulul Amr): ‘Ali and the Imams from his offspring (peace be on them).....	658
c. The Holy Prophet’s (peace be on him and his progeny) saying: My Ahl al-Bait are like Ark of Noah and like the Door of Hittah of the Bani Israel.....	659
<i>The Imams: ‘Ali and His Offspring (peace be on them all) Conveyers from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny)..</i>	662
The Story of Conveying the Verses of Surah Bara’ah (Taubah).....	664
The Meaning of "Unto me" in the Messenger of Allah’s hadiths	668
Bearer of the Messenger’s (peace be on him and his progeny) Knowledge	670
<i>The Two Grandsons of the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny).....</i>	682
Hasan and Husain (peace be on them both) are from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny).....	682
<i>Glad-Tidings of the Holy Prophet (peace be on him and his progeny) about the Reappearance of the Mahdi (may Allah hasten his reappearance) in the last time.....</i>	687
<i>Texts Proving the Imamate of the Imams from the Ahlul Bait (peace be on them all).....</i>	691
Hadith al-Thaqalayn	691
Irrefutable Texts from the Messenger of Allah (peace be on him and his progeny) their Number	695
The Hadith on the Number of Imams (peace be on them)	695
CHAPTER FOUR	722
<i>Summing up the Discussion of Imamate according to both schools</i>	723
<i>The Historical Reality of the Establishment of the Caliphate.....</i>	725

<i>Features of the two school (vol. 1).....</i>	<i>19</i>
The Saqîfah of Banu Sa'îdah and Abu Bakr's Allegiance	727
'Umar's Allegiance	732
The Consultative Council (Shura) and 'Uthman's Allegiance.....	733
Imam 'Ali's (peace be on him and his progeny) Allegiance	735
<i>The Opinions of the Caliphate School of the Imamate</i>	<i>736</i>
Discussing The Opinion of the Caliphate School Concerning the Caliphate and Imamate	745
Firstly: The Consultative Council (Shura).....	745
Secondly: Allegiance:.....	747
Thirdly: The Companions' Practice:.....	748
Imam 'Ali's (peace be on him) Opinion as a Proof	748
The Compulsory Obedience of the Ruler and not Deposing Him for Transgression or Sinning	749
The Imaamah According to the Ahlul-Bait (peace be on them) School....	750
The Inclination of the Ruling Authorities during 13 Centuries	757
<i>Transliterations.....</i>	<i>760</i>